

APPROVED MINUTES
COCHISE COUNTY COMMUNITY COLLEGE DISTRICT GOVERNING BOARD
REGULAR MEETING

Tuesday, April 13, 2021
Sierra Vista Campus
Community Room
6:00 p.m.

Due to health concerns related to COVID-19, the Board had limited public group access to no more than 22 attendees (who were required to wear a face covering) in the Student Union Community Room located on the Cochise College Sierra Vista Campus. Members of the public who wished to attend the meeting via video conference, joined at <https://cochise.zoom.us/j/97097796854>.

1. GENERAL FUNCTIONS

1.01 Call to Order

Mr. Hudgins called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m.

Board Members Present:

Mr. David DiPeso
Mr. Don Hudgins
Mr. Dennis Nelson
Mr. Tim Quinn
Mrs. Jane Strain

1.02 Pledge of Allegiance

Mr. Hudgins led the Pledge of Allegiance.

1.03 Adoption of Agenda

Mrs. Strain requested Consent Agenda item, 2.01.17, Dr. James “Bo” Hall’s retirement, be pulled for further discussion. There were no additional changes, and the agenda was adopted as amended.

1.04 Citizen’s In-person Interim

There were no requests to address the Board outside of individuals requesting to address agenda item 2.02 Reduction in Force and 2.05 Aviation Program Options.

1.05 Standing Reports

1.05.1 Representative to the Arizona Association of Community College Trustees (AACCT)

No update provided, as there were no new updates.

1.05.2 Senate

The Governing Board reviewed a written March Senate Report, and accepted as submitted.

1.05.3 Student Government Association (SGA)

The Governing Board reviewed a written Student Government Association Report, and accepted as submitted.

1.05.4 College President

Dr. Rottweiler provided the board with updates; highlights include:

Legislative Update:

- Continue to be in a wait and see mode as budget discussions continue at the Capitol. The Arizona Community College Coordinating Council (AC4) hold weekly legislative briefings, and at this point in time, the agendas for the Floor and Committee of the Whole have become very limited. The AC4 members feel very good with where community colleges are in the regular budget and the additional appropriations.
 - Cochise College – additional formula funding - \$291,000
- Bills of Note:
 - Representative Regina Cobb’s HB 2836–Appropriations: Rural Colleges passed the House 56-3 and was referred to Senate Appropriations Committee. Testified on the bill at the request of Senate Appropriations Chair, David Gowan. The bill received a “do pass” on an 8-1 vote. The bill appropriates an additional \$21.2 million to rural community college districts for shovel ready projects. Just over \$4M is recommended for Cochise College for the First Responder Academy/Transportation Center Driving Range initiative to be hosted on the Douglas Campus.
 - HB2523–Four-Year Degrees: Community Colleges is a bill sponsored by Representative Becky Nutt. The bill is in a holding pattern waiting action. There has been some significant push back from the Arizona Board of Regents (ABOR). A letter from the Chief Lobbyist for ABOR with a response from Interim Chancellor, Steven Gonzales at Maricopa were shared with the board.
 - SB1294–Community College: Expenditure Limitation is a strike all bill, now sponsored by Representative Tim Dunn. This bill now primarily provides a hold harmless for three years. It passed out of Senate Appropriations but will require significant work on the Senate Floor, including amendments to reduce the timeframe to two years and increase the penalty. Cochise College does not have an Expenditure Limitation (EL) issue.
 - SB 1377–Civil Liability; Public Health Pandemic was signed by Governor Ducey on April 5. This law provides civil liability protections related to COVID-19.
- Testified, via Zoom, on the Rural Community College Bill before Senate Appropriations, and was joined by President Stacy Klippenstein from Mohave and Kristen Boilini, representing AC4.
- On March 23, presented before the Rural Caucus, along with four AC4 colleagues. It was a very positive meeting receiving significant support for the Rural Appropriation Bill and re-energized the EL bill. Great support from rural legislators.

COVID-19 Updates:

- Employee vaccinations:

- On March 22, 2021, 49 shots were administered to employees and their qualified dependents. Their second dose will be on April 19.
- Student vaccinations:
 - Sierra Vista Campus: March 30, 2021 - 82 Moderna shots administered; the second shot scheduled for April 27
 - Douglas Campus: April 6, 2021 - 33 J&J shots and 87 Moderna shots administered; the second shot scheduled for May 4
 - For fall, the Benson Safeway pharmacy has agreed to provide vaccinations, if there is a need, during the first few weeks of school. They will also be able to provide flu shots on campus for students in September.
- As the Board requested, a detailed briefing from Nursing and Allied Health will be presented on student participation in the Points of Distribution (POD) later in the meeting.

General Comments:

- Phi Theta Kappa participated in the International Convention and Cochise College was recognized with two International awards: Distinguished Honors in Action and Top 100 Chapter. Congratulations to all!
- Cochise College Athletics:
 - The men's basketball team won the Arizona Community College Athletic Conference championship and beat Arizona Western to advance to the national tournament to be held in Hutchinson, Kansas. Congratulations to Coach Carrillo, Lane, and Mathews, the team, and trainers for a job well done despite adversity.
 - Both the Men's and Women's Rodeo teams competed in the Grand Canyon Region competition; both teams qualified for the College National Finals Rodeo to be held in Casper, Wyoming in June. Nine student-athletes will compete in numerous events. Three student-athletes to compete in multiple events, including Jill Donnelly and Maddee Doerr who had a clean sweep in the women's all-around. Congratulation to Rick and Lynn Smith and the entire rodeo program. Special thanks to the Cochise County Fair Association and Nikki Valenzuela for being so accommodating to the region and Cochise College Rodeo.
- Presented to the Sierra Vista City Council on March 11. Will host the Douglas Mayor Donald Huish on the Douglas Campus on Thursday for lunch and a tour. Also joining will be Dr. Gary Packard, Dean of College of Applied Science and Technology (CAST) from the University of Arizona South.
- Out of the office April 28-30.
- The May Board Meeting is moved to the first Tuesday (May 4) to accommodate schedules. The meeting will be preceded by a Truth in Taxation Hearing.

Questions or comments:

Mr. Quinn questioned some language in HB2523—Four-Year Degrees: Community Colleges regarding the delineation for counties over 750,000 people and counties under 750,000; is it an all or nothing bill. Dr. Rottweiler noted the bill passed out of the House overwhelmingly, and AC4 has stayed neutral on the bill. He also stated that additional funding would be required.

1.05.5 Monthly Financial Report – March 2021

The Financial Report for March 2021 was presented and accepted as submitted.

2. NEW BUSINESS *

2.01 Consent Agenda *

The following items were approved:

- 2.01.1 * Classified Staff; Appointment (*Marco Franco Rios, User Support Technician II, Sierra Vista Campus*)
- 2.01.2 * Administrative Support; Appointment (*Ryan Sermon, Career Services Coordinator, District-wide, based on the Sierra Vista Campus*)
- 2.01.3 * Administrative Support; Appointment (*Miriam Salcedo-Dupuis, Small Business Development Center Business Analyst, Downtown Center*)
- 2.01.4 * Administrative Staff; Appointment (*Matildo "Matt" Coppi, Assistant Dean of Military Programs, Fort Huachuca Education Center*)
- 2.01.5 * Faculty; Appointment (*Carmen Brady, Instructor of ESL, Douglas Campus*)
- 2.01.6 * Faculty; Appointment (*Virginia Delear, Instructor of Math, Douglas Campus*)
- 2.01.7 * Faculty; Appointment (*Jordan Price, Instructor of Communication, District-wide, based on the Sierra Vista Campus*)
- 2.01.8 * Faculty; Appointment (*Carlos Zeisel, Instructor of Sociology, District-wide, based on the Sierra Vista Campus*)
- 2.01.9 * Classified Staff; Resignation (*Breona Mouton, Division Assistant, Sierra Vista Campus*)
- 2.01.10 * Classified Staff; Resignation (*Andrew Parra, Department Assistant – Residential Life, Douglas Campus*)
- 2.01.11 * Classified Staff; Resignation (*Luis Peralta, Facility Services Technician, Douglas Campus*)
- 2.01.12 * Administrative Support; Resignation (*Edwin Schasteen, Math Tutor, Douglas Campus*)
- 2.01.13 * Administrative Staff; Resignation (*Darrel Crowley, Building and Grounds Manager, Sierra Vista Campus*)
- 2.01.14 * Faculty; Resignation (*Terri Berg, Instructor of Student Success, Sierra Vista Campus*)
- 2.01.15 * Administrative Staff; Retirement (*Daniel Del Rio, Network Administrator, District-wide, based on the Sierra Vista Campus*)
- 2.01.16 * Administrative Staff; Retirement (*Rebecca Dorman, Writing Lab Supervisor, Sierra Vista Campus*)
- 2.01.17 * **PULLED FOR FURTHER DISCUSSION** - Administrative Staff; Retirement (*Dr. James "Bo" Hall, Executive Director of Student Services, District-wide, based on the Sierra Vista Campus*)
- 2.01.18 * Administrative Staff; Retirement (*Dr. John Walsh, Director of Library Services, District-wide, based on the Sierra Vista Campus*)
- 2.01.19 * 2021-2022 Cyber Course Fees Schedule
- 2.01.20 * Acceptance of Minutes for March 9, 2021 – Regular Meeting
- 2.01.21 * Acceptance of Minutes for March 25, 2021 – Special Meeting

Mr. Quinn moved, and Mr. Nelson seconded a motion to approve the Consent Agenda pulling item 2.01.17. Mr. Quinn noted that Matt Coppi is a tremendous former soldier, Battalion Command Major, and Sergeant Major, and he understands soldiers at all ages. The Governing Board unanimously approved with members, David DiPeso, Don Hudgins, Dennis Nelson, Jane Strain, and Tim Quinn all voting aye. **MOTION CARRIED.**

Mrs. Strain addressed the retirement of Dr. Bo Hall, who will be retiring with over 38 years of service to Cochise College. Dr. Rottweiler mentioned that Cochise College is a much better place because

of Dean Hall's service and commitment to students and his love for the college. Mrs. Strain thanked Dean Hall for his years of dedication. Dean Hall addressed the Board thanking them and administration for their support. He noted that along with his 38 years of service, he also attended Cochise College, as a student, for five years. God blessed him with his wife, family, and Cochise College. At the request of Mr. Quinn, Dean Hall shared an impactful student story. Mr. Quinn moved and Mr. Nelson seconded a motion to approve Consent Agenda item 2.01.17, the retirement of Dr. Bo Hall. The Governing Board unanimously approved with members, David DiPeso, Don Hudgins, Dennis Nelson, Jane Strain, and Tim Quinn all voting aye. **MOTION CARRIED.**

***** Introduction of New Employees *****

Wick Lewis, Executive Director of Human Resources, introduced Bonnie Braley, Payroll Benefits Specialist, and Vanessa Crabtree, Administration Building Assistant.

2.02 Faculty – Reduction in Force

The administration requested the Governing Board adopt a motion to approve the President's recommendation of reduction in force to eliminate the position of Instructor of Culinary Arts currently held by Ms. Danielle Cardella.

Dr. Rottweiler noted that reductions are difficult decisions that need to be made in order to keep the college moving forward and programs vibrant. Pursuant to Policy 639, Reduction in Force, the policy directs the college to maintain sound and balanced educational programs that are consistent with the functions and responsibilities of the college, and the allocation of resources to best meet the needs of the college and support the college's mission, vision, and goals.

On March 4, 2021, Ms. Danielle Cardella and Lora Miller were notified in person, and via a letter that their positions had been recommended for a reduction in force. The reduction in force outlined to move the culinary arts program from a credit-based program to a non-credit based program. Pursuant to the policy, Ms. Cardella and Ms. Miller requested a review by the President's Office, which was received on March 11. In review of the recommendation from the Dean and the Provost, the decision was made not to transition the entire program, but instead to return to a one faculty based initiative.

Dr. Rottweiler shared enrollment data for the program noting that in 2013, enrollments were as high as 160 and a second faculty member was added. Over the course of the last six or seven years, the enrollment has continued to decline. In continuing the program as a credit program, with a requested curriculum change over the next couple of years that might better meet the needs of the local business and industry.

Mr. Hudgins, Board Chair, turned time over to allow comments from six members of the public who wished to speak to the agenda item; noting each had two-minutes. The following individuals addressed the board:

- Danielle Cardella, Culinary Arts Instructor, began her address to the board requesting an appeal of the decision and a review of the recommended reduction in force. Stating that if the position were eliminated, it would leave one instructor to teach-out the remaining students. It leaves Ms. Miller to finish the work of teaching classes, to find associate faculty to finish the curriculum, to do the marketing of students at the high schools, to purchase foods for the class, and to maintain the standards of the program and the equipment. It is a disservice to program students and to the college to just eliminate and do a teach-out expecting one person to do the rest of the work. Ms. Cardella asked, in regards to

restructuring, reorganizing of the culinary program, what difference in the program deficit is made up by the elimination of the faculty position, and where will the remainder of the deficit be made up? She also acknowledged that enrollment is down, and not making enough money for the program to be sustainable and effective, but there is more that can be done by the college from a marketing standpoint or the dean of workforce development can do to better the program. Ms. Cardella also asked how the loss of students would be relative to the loss of faculty and how will it further impact the program deficit.

- Responding to Mr. DiPeso's inquiry into the decline of enrollment, Ms. Cardella stated that high school students are not taking culinary dual enrollment, COVID related decline, and the program is not retaining students.
 - Mr. Nelson noted that the industry needs have changed and there is not much need for head chef positions as there are for lower level culinary positions that require a certificate rather than an accredited program. Ms. Cardella responded noting that part of a proposed curriculum change would address the industry change by offering more certificates.
- Ms. Lora Miller, Culinary Arts Instructor, addressed the board emphasizing that the program has been working on a curriculum plan. The plan includes certificates that are much easier to obtain in a year, rather than two years, and they are still for credit. She has looked at other community colleges in the state, and all of them, except one, are still offering a for-credit culinary degree. Ms. Miller acknowledged the decline in enrollment and noted things need to change. Coming out of the shutdown, there is an opportunity to get the growth the program has been trying to get in the last couple of years with people interested in going back to school again like getting the line cook certificate or the fundamentals of culinary. Over the last couple of weeks, a list has been created of over fifteen people, business owners and managers in the county who have graduated from the program; the culinary program makes an impact in the community.
 - Mr. Nelson noted the enrollment has dropped precipitously and the board has a fiscal responsibility to support the programs that are exhibiting sufficient student enrollment. If the enrollment can get back up, the for-credit program could be reinstated. Ms. Miller responded, noting that she can do the job, but not to the efficiency as it can with two people and giving both faculty members another year a chance to bring the program back up, is a better idea.
 - Dr. Rottweiler clarified that the recommendation is to continue the program as a for-credit program, do the curricular changes, but do it with one full-time faculty member and the remainder with an associate faculty; similar to the way it was prior to 2013.
 - Mr. Quinn asked Ms. Miller for the one thing they will focus on to help turn the program around; Ms. Miller responded noting it will be the one-year certificate curriculum. As the program curriculum transitions, Mr. Quinn would like to see where the program is in one year.
- Mr. Angelo Bovaro began addressing the board noting he had a number of policies the college president is responsible for administering to which he wished to address. Policy 2002 budget preparation and adoption. It was mentioned that since 2015, student enrollment has decreased, but administration had not addressed the situation until now, when it is too late. Mr. Bovaro then addressed Policy 405, which requires the Cochise College administration to protect the college against financial risk. The presented action is to protect against that risk; however, eliminating one faculty member might save \$70K out of a \$70M budget, but how much is it really saving compared to the difference in students the college is going to lose. Enrollment solutions will not be created by decreasing enrollment capabilities. Mr. Bovaro expressed his concerns with administration waiting until now to address the enrollment declines and addressing it by getting rid of a faculty member and at the expense of losing more students who quit out of fear for not being able to finish their degree. Mr. Bovaro also addressed Policy 504, which dictates requirements for the

institutional effectiveness of the school, which includes planning resource allocations, reports program effectiveness and responds with actions to improve the effectiveness. Final comments to the board suggested an alternative to eliminating a faculty member, is to eliminate failing administrators and offer them associate positions.

- Mr. Nelson asked how a full-time faculty member is better than a number of associate faculty members; Mr. Bovaro responded stating that full-time faculty have the time to do all the work. Ms. Miller and Ms. Cardella work 10-12 hours a day getting students trained, shopping, developing curriculum, and recruiting students.
- Jeremy Summers addressed the board on behalf of Ms. Miller and Ms. Cardella noting he has worked in the industry for nearly 25 years. Joined the Army out of high school and had the privilege to serve General George W. Casey and Lloyd Austin. Coming out of the Army ten years ago, he wanted to make a difference. Mr. Summers graduated from the Cochise College Culinary program and has been an associate faculty. After graduating the program, Mr. Summers became a culinary high school teacher. He impressed upon his students that they did not need to go to a four-year college to get a culinary degree because they will pay three times as much and in the industry it will not mean as much as certificates, that is what the industry needs. As a hiring manager, he would hire a student right out of college with a certificate over someone who has twenty years of experience, because they do not come with the bad habits. Mr. Summer expressed that the quality of education from Ms. Miller and Cardella is that of a four-year college. By eliminating the position, the college is putting students in the program, the county, and Ms. Miller at a deficit.
- Jennifer Ovalle-Zelaya addressed the board expressing the importance to maintain two faculty members in the culinary program. The industry is growing and coming out of the Pandemic, more people want to go to restaurants and the restaurants need employees. Due to the demand, two teachers are needed to train quality workers. As much as the college has a fiscal responsibility, it also has a community responsibility. Cochise College is the heart of the employment in the community. Ms. Ovalle-Zelaya stated that due to the impending cut in faculty and with the teach-out of the program, the level of quality by students would not be maintained. Such activities as the Pit Fire, where over one hundred gallons of soup are provided, will not be at the same quality. Currently preparing for the event is a district-wide event with faculty and students pulling ten to twelve hour shifts; this cannot be done with less faculty and limited part-time employees.
- Andrea Womack-Johnson addressed the board stating she is a Veteran of the U.S. Navy, owner and chef of Zojo Graze LLC., and a 2020 graduate with associate's degree of applied science, culinary arts. Chef Danny taught her the techniques of culinary giants. Chef Lora taught her techniques of baking, and how to navigate the restaurant world. Ms. Womack-Johnson noted that she was able to take what she learned in the sanitation and food-purchasing class to not only improve her business, but to also open a second location and first restaurant in Sierra Vista. If the program is shut down, there will be no future restaurant entrepreneurs. She also thanked Chefs Danny and Lora for making her the chef she is today. Ms. Womack-Johnson stated she will be able to attend a culinary institute in Japan because of the skills she learned from the Cochise College culinary program. Her final note was for the board to look at what the full-time faculty do for the program.

Mr. Quinn moved, and Mr. Nelson seconded a motion approving the College President's recommendation of reduction in force to eliminate the position of Instructor of Culinary Arts currently held by Ms. Danielle Cardella, resulting in separation of employment effective May 14, 2021. Mr. Nelson noted it is not an easy decision when there is such a drastic decrease in enrollment, it does not seem justifiable to maintain two full-time faculty. If enrollment goes back up, maybe it can be reinstated, but the board has a responsibly to be prudent with college finances. The Governing

Board unanimously approved with members, David DiPeso, Don Hudgins, Dennis Nelson, Jane Strain, and Tim Quinn all voting aye. **MOTION CARRIED.**

2.03 Administrative Support – Reduction in Force

The administration requested the Governing Board adopt a motion to approve the President's recommendation of reduction in force to eliminate the position of Printing Services Coordinator currently held by Mr. Keith Ringey resulting in separation of employment effective June 30, 2021. Notification was sent to Mr. Ringey on March 4, 2021, and no request for review was received by the president's office.

Mr. Quinn moved, and Mr. DiPeso seconded a motion approving the President's recommendation of reduction in force to eliminate the position of Printing Services Coordinator currently held by Mr. Keith Ringey resulting in separation of employment effective June 30, 2021. There was no further discussion. The Governing Board unanimously approved with members, David DiPeso, Don Hudgins, Dennis Nelson, Jane Strain, and Tim Quinn all voting aye. **MOTION CARRIED.**

2.04 Revised Governing Board Policy 698 – Emergency Paid Sick Leave

The administration requested the Governing Board adopt a motion ratifying the revised Governing Board Policy 698 – Emergency Paid Sick Leave. The revision extends the expiration date to May 14, 2021.

Mr. Quinn moved, and Mr. Nelson seconded a motion ratifying the revised Governing Board Policy 698 – Emergency Paid Sick Leave. The revision extends the expiration date to May 14, 2021. There was no further discussion. The Governing Board unanimously approved with members, David DiPeso, Don Hudgins, Dennis Nelson, Jane Strain, and Tim Quinn all voting aye. **MOTION CARRIED.**

2.05 Fiscal Year 2021 – 2022 Personnel Listing

The administration requested the Governing Board adopt a motion approving the personnel listing containing the names of employees to be issued employment contracts for the ensuing fiscal year, pending other board actions.

Mr. Quinn moved, and Mr. DiPeso seconded a motion approving the personnel listing containing the names of employees to be issued employment contracts for the ensuing fiscal year. There was no further discussion. The Governing Board unanimously approved with members, David DiPeso, Don Hudgins, Dennis Nelson, Jane Strain, and Tim Quinn all voting aye. **MOTION CARRIED.**

2.06 Aviation Program: Transition Options

The administration requested the Governing Board adopt a motion directing administration to either reduce annual operation support for Aviation to \$500,000 and approve changes to tuition and course fees, or close the Aviation Program.

Dr. Fick, Executive Vice President/Provost, addressed the board noting that he and Ms. Burnett, Aviation Director, spent time since the March Board meeting working on a plan to best meet the goals of the board. The reduced annual operation proposal starts with a \$500,000 base funding from the college with all other resources to come from tuition and course fees. Dr. Fick noted the model has general limitations to include a \$500,000 limit on the college subsidy and the other is retaining the 40-student cap. To meet the limitations, staffing in the program will need

to be reduced from 15 to probably 10 to meet the model requirements. Also, need to have a more intensive flight schedule to get them all in with fewer staff. Will also need to look at the composition of the staff, such as the need for mechanics. Another limitation would look at reducing the aircraft from 15 to 8. Part of the idea would be to consider leasing aircraft, which will require a different level of maintenance, one that refers to a progressive maintenance structure allowing the program to keep plans active by taking shorter breaks for maintenance.

An increase in tuition and fees is another key in making the proposed plan work. Dr. Fick shared a table with proposed fees, which increases tuition for in-state students to \$275 and out-of-state tuition to \$398. The course fee proposed increase is approximately five percent. With the tuition increase and the five percent course fee increase recommendation, there should be enough revenue to cover other program expenses above the \$500,000 college subsidy.

Dr. Fick shared comparability with three other Aviation programs in Arizona. Tuition for Chandler Gilbert is \$425; Yavapai is \$525; and Embry Riddle is \$1,561. Cochise College's proposed course fees in comparison would be \$4,000 over Chandler Gilbert, \$16,000 lower than Yavapai, and \$4,000 less than Embry Riddle.

In summary, the proposed plan:

- More efficiency with personnel – reducing staff
- More efficiency with planes – leasing five new plans and requiring less maintenance time and freeing need for additional mechanics
- Frees up \$500,000 to \$600,000 in revenue for other CTE programs on the Douglas Campus.

Questions/Comments:

Mr. DiPeso asked about progressive maintenance; Ms. Burnett explained that a progressive maintenance program basically takes the required maintenance of the 100-hour inspections and annual inspections, and breaks them down into smaller chunks that can be done in shorter intervals. Instead of waiting for 100 hours of flight time for the inspection, they would do them every 25 hours of flight time, minimizing maintenance downtime.

Mr. Nelson expressed that he would like the program to continue if the numbers can be worked out. He also expressed that he would like to know more about publicizing the program and asked if the college marketing department will also be promoting the program. Mr. Nelson also noted that he wishes to meet with Ms. Burnett and go through the QS2 plan to make well-informed decisions. Dr. Rottweiler stated the presented proposed plan implements QS2, includes leased planes, increases tuition and fees, will have a 40-student cap, and will provide a plan to continue aviation within the guidelines the board requested. The only unknown in the plan is if the college can get 40 students to come to Cochise College with the increased tuition and fees, which administration believes they can.

Dr. Rottweiler explained that leasing planes eliminates the need to purchase future planes or engines.

Responding to Mr. Quinn, Dr. Fick explained that the grand total cost of the program for 35 students is \$1,839,429 with \$500,000 from the college's general fund, \$269,500 from tuition, and \$1,045,700 from course fees. The program cost with 40 students is \$1,854,065 with \$500,000 from the college's general fund, \$308,000 from tuition, and \$1,216,410 from course fees. Total expenses for 35 students is \$1,839,429 making the net revenue (\$24,229). The total expenses for 40 students is \$1,854,065 making the net revenue \$170,345.

Mr. Quinn reiterated that if the students do not come to the program, there will be no savings. In response, Dr. Rottweiler expressed that if students do not come to the program with the increased rates in the next two to three years, administration will come back before the board with a recommendation to close the program.

Mr. Quinn led a discussion regarding the \$125K fuel cost for 35 students, noting the cost is half of the \$250K in the proposed budget for salary raises. He pointed out that the cost for fuel alone could pay for two system analysts for the college supporting thousands of students versus 35-40 student in the aviation program. Mr. Quinn also states that he is not sure that spending \$1.3M is for the greater good of the greater Cochise College.

Responding to Mr. Quinn regarding what programs could be supported with the \$500,000 subsidizing the aviation program, Dr. Fick expressed that trades programs will benefit the economy in the Douglas area. Also having something in diesel will be beneficial in the Douglas area. Mr. Hudgins suggested considering a veterinary program; noting there may be a need in the near future for such a program.

Responding to Mr. DiPeso's question regarding the cost in the aviation facilities and runway, Ms. Burnett mentioned that Arizona Department of Transportation (ADOT) has invested approximately \$4M in the runway structure and the college has invested approximately \$500K with the 90/10 split grant. Remodeling buildings and installation of simulators is over \$6M. Dr. Rottweiler stated that the college would be required to continue the airport runway for at least an additional twenty years as a general use airport because of the received grant funds.

Responding to Mr. Quinn, Dr. Rottweiler asked the board to give the program two years, and then if enrollment is not at least 35 students, administration will bring a recommendation before the board to close the program. Mr. Quinn asked administration to set a trigger point in which the revenue does not match the college investments going into the program. Dr. Rottweiler stated that the program would have an auxiliary fund with the sale of the planes, if the program needs to dip into that fund for more than two years, then administration will bring it back for separation because the promise to run the aviation program for \$500,000, would not be fulfilled.

Mrs. Strain stated the program has eight very specific tasks that need action. She is confident that the program will complete all eight tasks, but if they do not, then extremely intensive focus needs to be on closing the program. Dr. Rottweiler acknowledged the direction of the board and noted administration will be back if they are not fulfilling the responsibility.

Mr. Hudgins, Board Chair turned time over to allow comments from two members of the public who wished to speak to the agenda item; noting they had two-minutes. The following individual addressed the board:

- Eric Fahrner addressed the board stating he is a Cochise College Aviation alumni. He has two properties in Cochise County and knows about the tax rates, and he would not be living the life style he is now, if it were not for the aviation program. Through fifty years of the program under the leadership of Lee Oppenheim, Chuck Perry, and Belinda Burnett, the program has not just a national, but also a worldwide reputation. In his airline driven aviation training and safety business in the Phoenix Metro area, Mr. Fahrner stated there is so much growth in aviation. The Cochise College aviation program is being underutilized. Mr. Fahrner asked if the college had considered the option of letting another flight school take over the program and run it for the college rather than closing it completely. The program could continue to operate at the college and remain in Cochise County. Responding to Mr. Nelson, Mr. Fahrner mentioned that the company he works for has purchased flight schools

from all over the world. Stating he is not speaking on behalf of his company, but makes the suggestion to the college for investigation because of the unique air space and all the curriculum, staff, and facilities the college already has. Mr. Fahrner went on to suggest that the college consider selling, before closing the program, as it is a very marketable asset.

- Ms. Burnett responded to Mr. Fahrner's suggestion to consider selling the program and stated that what Cochise College offers would be lost to an aviation community certificate mill. The programs focus on training people without focusing entirely on the quality the college is historically known for. It would be something to consider if the program cannot deliver with the plan it has presented.
- Angelo Bovara submitted a request to address the board, but was not present to speak when the Board Chair called upon him.

Mr. Nelson noted that during the March Board meeting, the decision was to reduce the support to the aviation program by \$500,000 versus a \$500,000 subsidy. Dr. Rottweiler responded noting that administration opted to go with a bottom up approach with an enrollment cap, providing the \$500,000 subsidy to have control over what happens. The program then needs to manage costs and increase student tuition and fees to cover the remaining costs.

Mr. Quinn moved, and Mr. DiPeso seconded a motion directing administration to reduce annual operation support for aviation at a cap of \$500,000 and approve changes to tuition course fees, lease of aircraft, and other recommendations as determined by the administration to achieve a \$500,000 cap for the aviation program for the next fiscal year. There was no further discussions. The Governing Board unanimously approved with members, David DiPeso, Don Hudgins, Dennis Nelson, Jane Strain, and Tim Quinn all voting aye. **MOTION CARRIED.**

The Board Chair recessed the meeting for a quick break at 7:53 p.m. and returned to open session at 8:00 p.m.

3. INFORMATION ITEMS

INFORMATION

3.01 Communications

- Dr. Rottweiler received a letter of appreciation to Cochise College Nursing and Allied Health Departments from Eric Andersen, Acting Board Chair for Fry Fire District. The letter shared the heartfelt gratitude of the men and women of the Fry Fire District for the incredible work the Nursing and EMS Departments have been providing the community over the past few months. In collaboration with college staff and the Cochise County Health and Social Services Department, the Fry Fire District has helped vaccinate more than 5,000 county residents and employees who are in the highest risk categories. Mr. Andersen specifically recognized Melesa Ashline and Kelly Juvera for their positive attitude, work ethic and commitment to service. Also, recognizing the Cochise College nursing and paramedic students for their hundreds of volunteer hours in support of the fight against the COVID-19 pandemic.

3.02 Nursing and Allied Health COVID Community Collaboration Report

Beth Hill, Dean of Nursing and Allied Health, and Melesa Ashline, Director of Nursing, provided a presentation to the Governing Board from the Nursing and Allied Health department summarizing the various ways the department worked with and in the community during the COVID pandemic. Highlights include:

PPE and Equipment Distribution to Community Hospitals:

- Copper Queen – 4 Gurneys

- Canyon Vista
 - Boxes of Gloves
 - Isolation Gowns
 - PPE Kits
 - Face Masks (with and without shields)
 - Ventilators (10)

Student Testing:

- Downtown Center testing parking lot – August 14
- Downtown Center in Facility
 - CNA – October 6
 - Nursing – October 13
- Community Partners
 - Chiricahua Community Health Center
 - National Guard
 - Dr. Parag Patel
 - Dr. Jeffery Wilde
- CLIA Waiver (Clinical Laboratory Improvement Amendment) in the name of Cochise College with Ms. Ashline as the director approved to perform COVID tests
 - Received approval from Arizona Department of Health and Services for Dr. Davis and Shane Van Bibber, to enter test results into state database.
 - November 2020
 - Working with Cochise County Health – Student COVID Testing
 - December 2020
 - Application submitted to ADHS
 - CLIA Waiver Granted
 - Cochise Faculty and Employee Training
 - January – Douglas Campus
 - 2 Athletic Trainers
 - Director of Residential and Student Life
 - January – Downtown Center
 - Dean
 - Lab/SIM Coordinator
 - Director of EMS
 - March – Downtown Center
 - CNA Coordinator & Faculty

Cochise College Administered COVID Testing:

- Abbott Binax-now Rapid antigen COVID-19 test kits
 - Cochise County Health Delivered over 1200 kits to the Downtown Center in January
 - Haven in Sierra Vista and Douglas – 160 kits
- Benefits: Prevent/control outbreak
 - Able to perform tests as needed – 15 to 30 minutes for results
- Performed over 200 tests since January
 - 180 students trained as well as faculty to give injections

Community Vaccine PODS:

- Cochise County Health Inquiry – December 22
- Fry Fire Department Inquiry – January 5
- Started on January 23 – Fry Fire – 279 Vaccines (nursing)
- Current PODS collaboration
 - Paramedic students

- Medical Assistant students
- Locations (Willcox, SV, Bisbee, and Douglas)
 - Local doctors/nurse practitioners
 - Copper Queen Hospital
 - Fire departments
 - Buena high school
- Total vaccines administered
 - 11,200 vaccines as of 04/13/2021

Miscellaneous Assistance:

- Arizona Department of Health portal registration
 - College faculty and staff
 - College students
 - Community members

Community Vaccine PODS & Registration Benefits:

- Walk-ins for faculty, staff, administration, and students
- Clinical hours – State Board Recognized
- Recognized volunteers hours
- Marketing of programs and college – on Facebook and in newspaper
- Community shareholders give back
 - Respirators filters for N95 masks (CVMC)
 - Respirators FIT test (Copper Queen)
 - \$600-\$700 for the test fitting kids
 - Benson Hospital – donated gloves to students for Saturday vaccine clinics
- Prevention

Ms. Hill shared the story of Marcos, an LPN to RN student scheduled to graduate in May 2021, however, in January, Marcos was in the ICU on a ventilator in a Tucson hospital with COVID-19. Marcos is now home and recovering. He plans to return next year to finish the program. Marcos has asked that his story be shared to help encourage people to be vaccinated and the importance of protecting themselves.

Questions/Comments:

Mr. Nelson mentioned that the pandemic, as disruptive and horrible as it has been, has offered an opportunity for organizations to come together and work with each other. Copper Queen Hospital enjoys having the college students help administer approximately 13,000 vaccines.

Mr. Quinn expressed his thanks to the team for all they have done to help. Canyon Vista Medical Center is very grateful for the help the nursing program has provided. Responding to Mr. Quinn's question regarding what is the number one thing needed in the nursing program; Ms. Ashline said the program is looking to increase the simulations to maintain the online training.

Mrs. Strain expressed her thanks for all the program has done in the community.

Mr. Hudgins also expressed his appreciation to the program and the students.

Dr. Rottweiler presented Ms. Ashline and Ms. Hill with a plaque and District coins from the Fry Fire District. He also stated this is what a community college is about, not only providing educational opportunities to students so they can live their dreams, but also saving lives. Dr. Rottweiler recalled a message he received from Canyon Vista Medical Center expressing their appreciation for the loaned ventilators, which were in use saving lives of community members, at that time.

3.03 NISOD Awards - 2021

Dr. Verlyn Fick, Executive Vice President/Provost, announced and recognized the recipients of the National Institute for Staff and Organization Development (NISOD) Award.

Dr. Fick, Executive Vice President, recognized Karen Dale, Assistant Dean for Academic Support, Margarita Fate, Department Chair of Business and Instructor, and Ella Melito, Department Chair of English and Instructor as recipients of the National Institute for Staff and Organization Development (NISOD) Award. The NISOD award is an opportunity for the college to recognize employees that serve in four different areas: service to students, service to their department, service to the college, and service to the community.

Recognizing Dr. Dale, Dr. Fick read the nominating letter received on her behalf and presented her with a Cochise College Certificate of Excellence.

Recognizing Ms. Fate, Dr. Fick read the nominating letter received on her behalf. Ms. Fate was not in attendance to receive her Cochise College Certificate of Excellence during the meeting.

Recognizing Ms. Melito, Dr. Fick read the nominating letter received on her behalf and presented her with a Cochise College Certificate of Excellence.

Each recipient will also receive a NISOD medallion and certificate after the virtual conference later in April.

Dr. Rottweiler stated the recognitions of the three staff members, is a reminder of the amazing people that work at Cochise College, and he is very proud to call them colleagues.

3.04 Status of Information Security Program

Robert Gibbs, Chief Information Security Officer, provided a presentation and updated the Board on the Cochise College Information Security Program and the programs progress; highlights include:

Factors Driving Security Program updates to Governing Board:

- Evolving cyber threats against higher education
- Increased cyber risks impacting students, employees, and college operations – financial and fraud
- Trajectory of regulatory requirements will mandate a briefing

Information Security Program:

- Purpose:
 - Foundational to Information Security best practices and success
 - Federal regulatory requirement
- Areas Covered by Information Security Program:
 - Information Security Policy
 - Risk Management – allocating resources
 - Data Classification – identify most sensitive information and safeguarding it
 - Security Training – employees understand their responsibilities
 - Data Protections – minimum set of standards of safeguarding data
 - Vendor Compliance – require third-party vendors to maintain same level of protections as the college
 - Security Incident Response – well practiced plan to respond to the threat

Risk Management:

- Purpose
 - Critical to ensuring resources are expended on the most important security areas
 - A Federal and State requirement
- Actions
 - Perform annual risk assessments
 - Monitor projects to mitigate findings to completion
 - Re-assess the risks
 - This year's assessment
 - 6 critical risk areas: 1 mitigation complete; 4 of remaining 5 in progress
 - Remaining 1 critical risks to be mitigated NLT end of CY2021
 - 21 remaining of 26 identified non-critical risks have actions in progress to mitigate the risk areas

Compliance:

- Risk Assessment was a critical milestone to achieve
- Ongoing Initiatives addressing all findings from last year's audit
- Some initiatives will extend into FY2022; much improved security plan
- Much improved compliance and security posture

Questions/Comments:

Responding to Mr. Nelson regarding ransomware protections, Mr. Gibbs noted the college does have controls, protections, and way of watching for them.

Dr. Rottweiler informed the board that if they desired a full briefing regarding security plans, an executive session could be scheduled on a later date. Members of the Board expressed interest in a Work Session with an executive session for further updating.

3.05 Human Resources Annual Report

Mr. Wick Lewis, Executive Director of Human Resources, presented the annual Human Resources Staffing Profile and Report; highlights include:

Human Resource Metrics for 2020

- Reduction of 31 part-time employees with the reduction in face-to-face students due to COVID
- Average age of all full-time employees is one year younger than the previous year
- One third less applicants applying for positions at the college
- Increase in applicant interviews due to more phone and video based interviews – 329
- Employee Service Awards - given to three employees with 25 years of service to the college

Questions/Comments

Mr. Quinn expressed his appreciation for Mr. Lewis's enthusiasm during his employee introductions. He also asked for future reports to provide the percentage by ethnicity of full-time employees.

Responding to Mr. Nelson regarding the continuation of Zoom interviews beyond COVID, Mr. Lewis expressed that it would probably continue since it works and saves money on candidate travel. Face-to-face interactions would still be wanted for critical positions. Mr. Lewis also responded that more interviews were held even though there were less applicants because multiple phone or video interviews allowed for multiple levels of interviewing.

3.06 FY22 Preliminary Budget Update

The administration updated the Governing Board on the FY22 preliminary budget development distributing a preliminary changes document; highlights include:

Preliminary Budget is:

- Mission driven budget
- Tied to strategic priorities
- Base-forward budget – follows key principals
 - Student Centered
 - Data Driven
 - Employee Friendly
 - Technologically Enhanced
 - Future Focused

On-going Expenses - \$1,636,537

- Compensation and Benefits Plan
 - Benefits – 3% for classified and professional staff – minimum wage compression
 - Faculty, coaches, administrative staff – 2.5%
 - Briefed all staff during general session
 - ASRS increase from 12.04% to 12.22%
 - Health/Dental/Vision Insurance – increase from \$605/month to \$610
- Utilities
- Software
- IT Security
- Third-party contracts
- Deferred Maintenance
- Sabbatical replacement

Strategic Initiatives – \$1,535,059 (partial listing)

- Board Initiatives
 - Stackable credentials (Allied Health)
 - Electric Car Maintenance
 - Low Water Agriculture/Water Campus
- Police Academy
- Facilities
 - Security Cameras – across the district - \$305,000 requesting 40% out of the college fund balance

On-Going Expenses: \$1,636,537

College Initiatives: \$1,535,059

Additional Initiatives: \$1,502,685 (funded with COVID relief, FY21 end of year, and foundation)

Total: \$4,674,281

Revenue - \$3,051,914

- State Aid (M&O and Equalization) - \$12,295,800
- STEM - \$928,400 (decrease of \$86,100 from FY21)
- Tuition – 0 (no increase for FY22)
- Property Tax (2% + new construction) - \$932,638
 - Tax rate increase from 2.3963% to 2.4442%
 - A home with an assessed value of \$100,000 would increase \$4.79

- Reallocations/Savings - \$1,827,376
- Potential Revenues – (Unknown at this time)
 - PROP 207
 - CRRSA, American Rescue plan, and American Jobs Plan
 - Free Community College Movement

FY'22 Budget – Base Forward

- Revenue:
 - State Aid \$ 291,900
 - Tuition \$ 0
 - Property Tax \$ 932,638
 - Reallocations \$1,827,376
 - Fund Balance \$ 119,682
 - Total \$3,171,596
- Expenses/Initiatives:
 - On-Going Expenses \$1,636,537
 - College Initiatives \$1,535,059
 - Total \$3,171,596

Budget Development:

- Board Budget Retreat February 20, 2021
- President's Council Budget Retreat March 5, 2021
- Tuition and Fees Action Item March 9, 2021
- Preliminary Budget Discussion April 13, 2021
- Truth in Taxation May 4, 2021
- Budget Adoption June 8, 2021
 - Workforce Development Plan (Prop 301)
 - Compensation Plan
 - New, reclassified, and adjusted positions
 - College Initiatives
 - On-going
 - Strategic
 - Facilities

Questions/Comments:

Responding to Mr. Quinn regarding aviation program savings, Dr. Rottweiler noted the preliminary budget reallocates the \$500,000 savings.

Mr. Quinn asked about the donation of \$78,000 for the Virtual Cadaver, which is in the preliminary budget allocation. Dr. Rottweiler explained that if the donation funds are provided from Copper Queen Hospital, the donated funds would be put back into the budget for reallocation.

Mr. Nelson asked if only a two percent tax were approved this year, could four percent be approved next year; Dr. Rottweiler replied, yes.

Responding to Mrs. Strain regarding the fund balance, Dr. Rottweiler noted the balance is approximately \$22M. The funds are used for one-time purchases and not part of on-going funding. The budget will also include the potential \$4.1M should the state choose to appropriate for the First Responder Training Academy. If the funds come from the state, administration would request the board approve matching those funds from the fund balance for \$6-\$8M for the initiative, which would have a significant impact on the Douglas Campus.

Dr. Rottweiler thanked Debbie Craig, Dr. Davis, and their team for amazing work on preparing a balanced budget.

4. COMMENTS FROM GOVERNING BOARD MEMBERS

Mr. Hudgins turned the time over to Governing Board members to provide comments/share information.

- Mr. Quinn
 - Congratulated the Men's Basketball team; specific congrats to Brian Rios, MVP, Stephen Byard, player of the year, and Jerry Carrillo, Co-Coach of the Year.
 - Thanked Nursing for performing and personifying what a community college means in reaching out. "You save lives and you teach people how to save lives".
 - Thanked Dr. Davis and Dean Hall for helping facilitate the COVID testing and vaccines.
 - Thanked Dr. Fick for details that helped make a decision on the aviation program.
- Mrs. Strain
 - No comments
- Mr. Nelson
 - Expressed that he was always impressed with Dr. John Walsh for seeking out new initiatives and making the college library more than it was when he was in college. He also wished Dr. Walsh well and thanked him for his service.
- Mr. DiPeso
 - Thanked Dean Bo Hall for all his work at the college.
- Mr. Hudgins
 - Thank you.

5. ADJOURNMENT

Mr. Hudgins adjourned the meeting at 9:21 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted:

Crystal Wheeler, Executive Assistant, Office of the President

Mr. Dennis Nelson, Secretary of the Governing Board